

Theories of Right Action & Their Critics

Manner & Motive

Dr. Clea F. Rees

ReesC17@cardiff.ac.uk

Centre for Lifelong Learning
Cardiff University

Spring 2013





Kantian Duty

A Good Will

Doing One's Duty

Julie Tannenbaum: Manner & Motive

Thesis & Terminology

The Challenge to Kant

Distinguishing Manner & Motive

The Financial Analogy

Logical Structure

Strengths & Weaknesses

Schizophrenia & Alienation

Notes & Queries





A Good Will

“good without
qualification”

+

only thing good without
qualification



Kantian Duty

A Good Will

A Good Will

A good will, Kant claims is:

1. “good without qualification”
 - ▶ morally valuable in itself
 - ▶ no *condition* on its being good
 - ▶ nothing *else* that has to be true if it is to be good
 - ▶ *not* good because it can get something else
 - ▶ good *independently* of consequences/effects
2. the *only* thing good without qualification.





Kantian Duty

Doing One's Duty

The Importance of Doing One's Duty

Having a good will is a necessary & sufficient condition for being a good moral agent:

- ▶ all good moral agents have good wills;
- ▶ all those with good wills are good moral agents.

One has a good will iff one acts *from duty*

i.e. one does what one ought to do *because* one is aware that is what one ought to do.





Julie Tannenbaum: Manner & Motive

Thesis & Terminology

What is Julie Tannenbaum's main thesis or conclusion?

Which terms important in this article?





Julie Tannenbaum: Manner & Motive

The Challenge to Kant

The challenge to Kant (questions 3–5):





Julie Tannenbaum: Manner & Motive

Distinguishing Manner & Motive

What does Tannenbaum mean by the following?

Roughly, the distinction between the manner and the motive is this: the manner of an action is how it is done and the motive delineates the agent's reasons for acting. (324)





Julie Tannenbaum: Manner & Motive

The Financial Motive Analogy

Question 7 (financial motive analogy):





Julie Tannenbaum: Manner & Motive

Logical Structure

Question 8 (overall structure):





Julie Tannenbaum: Manner & Motive

Logical Structure

- ▶ The *manner* of one's action is the way in which one does it.
- ▶ The *motive* of one's action is the reason one does it.
- ▶ The manner and motive of one's action can be distinct. (e.g. piano)
- ▶ Emotion can affect the manner of one's action without being one's motive. (e.g. pride/science fair)
- ▶ In particular, the emotion of compassion can be expressed in the manner of one's action without being one's motive.
- ▶ For example, one may nurse compassionately from solely financial motives.
- ▶ The motives of financial gain and duty are relevantly similar.
- ▶ One can act compassionately for reasons of duty alone.
- ▶ For example, one can assist one's fallen grandmother compassionately from the motive of duty alone.





Julie Tannenbaum: Manner & Motive

Strengths & Weaknesses

Questions 11 & 12 (strengths & weaknesses):





Julie Tannenbaum: Manner & Motive

Schizophrenia & Alienation

Does Tannenbaum's position avoid moral schizophrenia?

Does acting from duty involve morally problematic alienation?





Julie Tannenbaum: Manner & Motive

Notes & Queries

- ▶ Does the fact that I would not teach this class were I not paid to do so show that my reason for teaching this class is financial gain?
- ▶ Is compassion a *feeling*? Does Tannenbaum think it is?
- ▶ Could one be a friend if motivated solely by duty?

