Deadlock

Thomson’s Move

Little’s Thesis

Argumentation
- The State of the Debate
- Arguments I
- Little’s Premises
- Arguments II
- Logical Structure
- The Importance of Relationship
- Anticipating Objections
- Evaluation

Typical Pro-Choice/Pro-Life Agreement

- Principles:
  - Persons have a right to control their bodies.
  - Persons have a right to life.
  - The right to life outweighs the right to control one’s body.
- Status:
  - The woman is a person.
  - The woman has rights to life and to control her body.
- Conditionals:
  - If the foetus is a person, then it has a right to life.
  - If the foetus has a right to life, then it has a right not to be aborted. [At least unless the woman’s life is endangered.]
Arguments

Arguments I

Clea F. Rees, Margaret Olivia Little, ‘Abortion, Intimacy, and the Duty to Gestate’

Thomson’s Move

Thomson Grants

- Principles:
  - Persons have a right to control their bodies.
  - Persons have a right to life.
- Status:
  - The woman is a person.
  - The woman has rights to life and to control her body.
  - The foetus is a person.
- Conditionals:
  - If the foetus is a person, then it has a right to life.

Arguments I

Thomson Rejects

- Conditionals:
  - If the foetus has a right to life, then it has a right not to be aborted. [At least unless the woman’s life is endangered.]

Arguments

Arguments I

Definition (Argument)
An argument consists of a set of sentences of which one is the conclusion and the rest are premises.

Definition (Conclusion)
The conclusion is the claim the argument tries to convince you of.

Definition (Premises)
The premises are claims which are supposed to support the conclusion.

Example (Argument)

1. Some cows have calves.
   ___
2. Some cows lactate.
Abortion
Argumentation
Arguments I

Example (Argument)

1. Cats detest being wrapped in
towels like burritos.
2. You ought not be cruel to cats.
   —
3. You ought not wrap cats in
towels like burritos.

Abortion
Argumentation
Arguments II

Example (Argument)

1. Abortion is the deliberate killing of a
human being.
2. If something is the deliberate killing of
a human being, then it is wrong.
   —
3. Abortion is wrong.

Abortion
Argumentation
Arguments II

Example (Argument)

1. My cat enjoys a good game of
tiddlywinks.
2. If my cat enjoys a good game of
tiddlywinks, then tiddlywinks is a
game loved by the gods.
   —
3. Tiddlywinks is a game loved by the
gods.

Abortion
Argumentation
Arguments II

Definition (Sub-Argument)
A sub-argument is an argument which forms one part of a larger argument.

Definition (Sub-Conclusion)
The conclusion of a sub-argument is a sub-conclusion of the overall argument.

Abortion
Argumentation
The Importance of Relationship

Example (Argument with Sub-Conclusion)

1. Abortion is the deliberate killing of a human being.
2. All human beings are persons.
3. If something is the deliberate killing of a person, then it is wrong.
   —
4. If something is the deliberate killing of a human being, then it is wrong. (From 2, 3)
   —
5. Abortion is wrong. (From 1, 4)